



**Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development & Cooperatives
Local Government Division
Local Government Engineering Department (LGED)**

5.7 Guidelines for Preparation of Citizen Report Cards (CRC)

**Project Coordination Office (PCO)
City Governance Project (CGP)**

February 2018



**Assisted by
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)
and
Urban Management Unit, LGED**

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	1
2. Justification	1
3. Relevant Issues as Included in ICGIAP	2
3.1 Task	2
3.2 Action by	2
3.3 Time Schedule.....	2
3.4 Indicators.....	2
4. Objectives of CRC	2
5. Relevant Organizations, Stakeholders and their role	3
5.1 Role of CC Mayor	3
5.2 Role of CC Officials.....	3
6. Necessary Tasks and Procedures	3
6.1 What is Citizen Report Card (CRC).....	3
6.2 Why Citizen Report Card?	3
6.3 Stages of CRC	3
6.3.1 Preparatory Stage	3
6.3.2 Implementation Stage	4
6.3.3 Reporting and Advocacy Stage	4
6.4 Outcomes of CRC	4
6.5 Methodology of Citizen Report Card Survey.....	4
6.5.1 Parameter Selection.....	4
6.5.2 Sampling	5
6.5.3 Data Collection.....	5
6.5.4 Data Processing.....	5
6.6 Preparation of Report	5
6.7 Discloser of Report.....	5
7. Implementation Schedule	6
8. Cost of Implementation	6
Annex I Sample Questionnaire	7

1. Introduction

Rapid urbanization accelerated by industry led economic growth has been taking place in Bangladesh. Potential of economic growth in urban areas is worthy of notice. There are 335 Local Government Institutions which cover 8% of total geographical area of Bangladesh and 30% of total population, while accounting for 60% of total national growth. On the other hand, the negative impact of dramatic change in urban areas is observed. The negative impacts are because the functions of municipalities and city corporations prescribed in Local Government (Pourashava) Act 2009 and Local Government (City Corporation) Act 2009, which are very relevant to the demand of city dwellers and urban development, are not implemented in an appropriate manner. In order to improve the public services provided by urban local governments, several urban development projects are being or were implemented by Local Government Divisions (LGD) and local government and engineering departments (LGED) with financial assistance of different development partners and government's own funds. Based on the experiences gained through implemented projects, effective activities for improvement of urban governance have been formulated as a program that has been well accepted. The urban governance improvement programs have been implemented to ensure good governance of those urban local government institutions namely Paurashava for equal, social harmony and planned development. Initiating urban governance improvement, LGD and LGED with financial support of JICA commenced a project named City Government Project (CGP) in 5 City Corporations.

A guideline has been prepared on Citizen Report Card (CRC) that will be used for measuring level of public satisfaction on services provided by the CC under the project.

2. Justification

City Corporation provides services to its citizen on the basis of tax collections, fees and government subsidy. A citizen of City Corporation (CC) has the basic right to get public services which are the prime needs of urban facilities and have the right to be involved in decision making process as they contribute to running the CC activities. But in most of the cases the citizens in our county are not aware about their rights on services and quality of service and even about the role of service providers. The result is that negligence of the service providers and poor quality of service may go unnoticed because there is no scope of participation that has been well introduced to the citizens.

At present it is realized that in the absence of transparency on overall services provided by the CC, efficiency on service delivery system and citizen participation on policy making are essential to establish good governance. From this point of view it is very rational to evaluate the existing quality of services, problems associated with these services and overall activities of CC from citizens' perspective in terms of the major components of governance i.e. efficiency, transparency, accountability, and participation. Citizens' recommendations and thinking for improving the existing service delivery system of CC should also be evaluated.

The Citizen Report Card (CRC) survey will act as symbol of transparency for the CC which will help further overcome the limitations and support participatory policy making. At the same time it is also expected that the CC will benefit from the survey and take initiative towards positive motivation by exploring citizens' views for decision makers to ensure delivery of quality services.

3. Relevant Issues as Included in ICGIAP

3.1 Task

Citizen Report Card is essential to obtain feedback from citizens about the quality of service delivery as well as overall performance of city management. It is a monitoring tool to set policy to improve the services provided by CC. The following are the initial steps and tasks to conduct the Citizen Report Card survey;

Task 1: Set Working Group (WG) with 3 members to prepare the CRC as per guideline.

Task 2: Distribute citizen report cards (minimum 500 cards) and conduct survey separately to receive feedback from households and citizens as well as commercial/social institutions or organizations etc. by conducting the CRC survey once in every year.

Task 3: W/G compiles CRC data and prepares a report with recommendations for further improvement of services and presents the report in CSCC meeting.

Task 4: Discussion on draft CRC report and recommendation to take decision for further improvement of services.

Task 5: Use feedback in the citizen's report card to identify/assess gap in the existing services and facilities and to project the demand of services and facilities. Also use the result for enhancing accountability of the CC.

Task 6: Compile the result and disclose at least twice within phase-2 implementation period.

3.2 Action by

Mayor/CEO

WG/Person in charge

3.3 Time Schedule

System of Citizen Report Cards

Task 1-3: by mid of 1st year

Task 4: by end of 1st year

Task 5-6: by end of 2nd year

3.4 Indicators

1st PR

Citizen report cards prepared/revised and approved by CSCC

2nd PR

i) Citizen report cards /prepared/revised and approved by CSCC.

ii) The card distributed and the results compiled and disclosed at least once

4. Objectives of CRC

The broad objective of citizen report card survey is to explore the service delivery efficiency of CC from citizens' perspective. The specific objectives are as follows:

- To represent the existing service delivery status of CC.
- To measure citizens' awareness level about different services provided by CC.
- To learn the existing services consumption pattern of citizens and their needs and demands on this issue.

- To measure the level of satisfaction and evaluate the quality of different services from citizens' point of view.
- To identify the problems associated with existing service delivery system and the management mechanism of the citizen.
- To accumulate the citizens' recommendations for better service delivery system and to solve the existing problems.

5. Relevant Organizations, Stakeholders and their role

5.1 Role of CC Mayor

The Mayor will set a Task Team (TT) involving 3 officials for organizing to conduct the citizen report card survey as per guideline.

5.2 Role of CC Officials

The Task Team of CRC survey will take initiative to conduct the survey with necessary arrangements of printing questionnaire, other logistics and recruitment of enumerators for data collection from door to door. After completion of data collection, the Task Team will take initiative to compile the data and prepare the report. The report will be disclosed through CSCC meeting by the TT.

6. Necessary Tasks and Procedures

6.1 What is Citizen Report Card (CRC)

The potential public feedback is very important for policy makers to ensure better services provided by the CC. A report card is the reflection of collective summary of the public opinion of service provider. It is a unique tool for measuring public view about the quality of services provided by the CC within its geographical location. It also can measure the efficiency and effectiveness of CC through assessing the level of citizen's satisfaction. This survey is an excellent tool to gather public opinion. The **World Bank defined Report Card Survey as "A means by which citizens can provide credible and collective feedback on public agencies about their performance"**.

6.2 Why Citizen Report Card?

Report Card Survey accumulates information about the service delivery efficiency system and identifies the gaps and flaws of different service providing agencies. The result of the report card survey provides an opportunity to the CC to increase their effectiveness and efficiency through continuous monitoring and evaluation. The feedback of the citizens can also act as an important consideration for the policy makers responsible for designing service delivery at CC level. Implementation of the public feedback accumulated from the report card can also ensure public participation and citizen partnership in service delivery system of CC.

6.3 Stages of CRC

6.3.1 Preparatory Stage

CC will demarcate the geographical area for report card survey. The survey will be conducted among minimum 500 citizens. Conduct survey separately to receive feedback from households and citizens as well as commercial/social institutions or organizations etc. by engaging enumerator twice in every year. Respondents will be selected from those demarcated areas in a non biased way. So, determination of sample size will be performed

analyzing areas and respondents to be surveyed with a convenient and appropriate sampling technique. A questionnaire will be prepared for pre-testing controversial issues, such as, nature and type of corruption, non-transparency, lack of accountability, types of irregularities and mismanagement of services provided by the CC. The pre-tested questionnaire will then be finalized on the basis of field observations conducted with a substantial number of respondents.

6.3.2 Implementation Stage

The field survey will be conducted in this stage with a preferred and suitable data collection technique. The surveyor will play a vital role for the accumulation of a representative dataset. The field data will be verified and edited through cross checking. Missing information will be recollected from the field. The edited information will be tabulated using proper computer software to make it fit for the analysis.

6.3.3 Reporting and Advocacy Stage

The report card will be finalized in this stage through compiling the data of all relevant issues. The compiled report will be presented in CSCC for approval. The final findings of the survey may be broadcast through CBO, WLCC etc. for advocacy to the CC authorities to take appropriate actions to follow up undertaking the public services.

6.4 Outcomes of CRC

- The survey will explore the actual situation of the public services delivered by the CC from citizens' views.
- The result of CRC will act as a baseline database for the service delivery system and be an option for monitoring and evaluation of service delivery efficiency and delivery pattern by considering the satisfaction level of citizens.
- The result will also be an option for ranking of different services on the basis of citizen's satisfaction and service delivery efficiency.
- The report card survey will provide an opportunity to the decision makers to explore the tone of citizens' views so that policy and decisions can be made on participatory approach.

6.5 Methodology of Citizen Report Card Survey

The Mayor will assign a 3 member task team for organizing the report card survey. The task team will deploy the surveyor for conducting the survey. The surveyor will be trained for collecting data by covering respondents of commercial and residential areas selected by cluster sampling method. A number of parameters will be selected for analyzing the data through using SPSS software.

6.5.1 Parameter Selection

The following parameters may be selected as common facilities and services provided by the CC:

- Water Supply
- Waste Management
- Footpath Maintenance
- Street light
- Health facilities
- Community Center
- Bazar /Market facilities
- Drainage Facilities
- Road Maintenance
- Mosquito control
- Education facilities
- Public Toilet facilities
- Park Development
- Bus/truck stand facilities

- Holding Tax
- Grave yard facilities
- Other tax and fees

The question will be how efficient is the service provisioning status of the CC and the respondents will be asked to respond about their level of satisfaction which will be the basic parameter of the study. The level of satisfaction will be categorized into three groups; whether 'satisfied', whether 'moderately satisfied' or whether 'dissatisfied'. To evaluate relationship of level of satisfaction with associated problems, type of problems, and means of solving problems, several parameters will be included for identifying why respondents are satisfied, moderately satisfied, or dissatisfied. Critical parameters are cost, distance, adequacy and quality of services. Additionally the aspects associated with the authority: responsiveness, efficiency, bureaucracy and favoritism will be also included. The socioeconomic profile of the respondents will be included for identifying who respondents are and what their level of satisfaction is. Respondents will also be asked to describe their experiential recommendations, how satisfied are they that they received the services provided by the authority and with the authority's follow up, the end result of the report card. Consequently, the study presents people's recommendations which would assist toward motivation, advocating CC authority to follow up people's needs, problems, and potentials.

6.5.2 Sampling

Cluster sampling method will be followed for conducting the study. The area of each ward will be divided into different clusters. The residential area will be surveyed randomly for data from residential respondents and commercial area will be surveyed for data from commercial respondents.

6.5.3 Data Collection

A required number of survey team members will be organized for data collection both in residential and commercial areas. A two day training session will be conducted for the surveyor to make clear the Report Card Survey and the techniques of data collection through pre-selected questionnaire.

6.5.4 Data Processing

Data processing will be accomplished in three phases; 1) error checking with the help of cross checking, 2) interview sheets having missing information are re-surveyed, and finally, 3) checked and completed data will be stored on the computer supporting SPSS spreadsheet.

6.6 Preparation of Report

Data will be analyzed, findings accumulated and conclusion will be drawn. Findings will be accumulated in terms of objectives set for this study and finally concluded through assessing the satisfaction level of the respondents.

6.7 Discloser of Report

The report will be disclosed through CSCC, WLCC, CG/CBO and web portal of each CC.

7. Implementation Schedule

Sl	Actions	Action by	Time schedule
1.	Setting Task Team (TT) with 3 members	TT	Initially
2.	Conduct minimum 500 questionnaire survey	TT	Each after 6 months
3.	Compile questionnaire prepared report	TT	Each after 6 months
4.	Discuss draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC	TT	Each after 6 months
5.	Identify/assess gaps by feedback of survey	TT	Each after 6 months
6.	Compile the result and disclose at least twice a year	TT	Each after 6 months

Note: After project support CC will continue the activities by their own initiative.

8. Cost of Implementation

Indicative cost breakdown of the activities at each CC for one year

Sl	Name of Activity	Cost in Tk.	Remarks
01	Meeting of Task Team (TT) with 3 members	1000.00	
	Printing of 500 questionnaire at least twice a year	10000.00	
	Conduct minimum 500 questionnaire survey by recruiting enumerators twice a year	100000.00	
	Compile questionnaire and prepare report	50000.00	
	Discuss draft CRC report and recommendation taken from CSCC	10000.00	
	Identify/assess gaps by feedback of survey	10000.00	
	Compile the result and disclose at least twice a year	10000.00	
	Total	191000.00	

Annex I Sample Questionnaire

Local Government Engineering Department (LGED)
 City Governance Project (CGP)
 Citizen Report Card (CRC)
 (CRC Survey Questionnaire)

A. General information

1. Name of City Corporation	:		Serial No.	:					
2. Ward Number	:		3. Name of Area/Mahalla	:					
4. Type of Area (use code)	:		5. Holding No.	:					
6. Date of Interview	:	D	D	M	M	Y	Y	Y	Y
7. Name of Interviewer	:								

B. Citizens perception and satisfaction level on City Corporation (CC) services

1. Basic information on household (use code based on reply)

1.1 Name of Respondent	:							
1.2 Mobile Number of Respondent	:							
1.3 Relationship of respondent with household head	:							
1.4 Name of father/husband of the respondent	:							
1.5 Name of mother of the respondent	:							
1.6 Age of respondent	:		1.6 Sex	:		1.7 Religion	:	
1.8 Educational qualification	:		1.9 Type of resident	:				
1.10 Type of house ownership	:		1.11 Type of main room of house	:				

2. Citizens' views regarding receipt and provision of City Corporation services

2.1 City Corporation provides following services to the citizens; what services are you getting currently and how much are you satisfied with the services? (use code based on the satisfaction level on receiving services)

01	Road		08	Bus/truck stand		15	Graveyard	
02	Street light		09	Kitchen market		16	Certificates (citizenship /birth /death /marriage)	
03	Footpath		10	Reserved space for women in the market		17	17 Vehicle license	
04	Drainage		11	Slaughter house		18	Trade license	
05	Water supply		12	Facility for recreation/park		19	Approval of building construction	
06	Sanitation		13	Facility of town beautification		20	Grievance redress/resolution	
07	Waste management		14	Community center		21	Fixation of holding tax & collection	

Code: 1 Highly satisfactory 2 Moderately satisfactory 3 Not satisfactory

2.2 Did you contact City Corporation in last one year to resolve any problem/get any services? (use √)

1 Yes.		If yes, for what kind of problems/services you contacted?	
01	Road		
02	Street light		
03	Footpath		
04	Drainage		
05	Water supply		
06	Sanitation		
07	Waste management		
08	Bus/truck stand		
09	Kitchen market		
10	Reserved space for women in the market		
11	Slaughter house		

2 No.		If no, what is the reason?	
01	Lack of awareness		
02	Lack of trust and confidence		
03	Lack of time		
04	Complexities		
05	Not needed		
06	Other, specify		

2.3 How did you contact? (use √)			
1	In person	2	In writing
3	Over telephone	4	Other, specify

2.4 What is the result of the contact? (use √)					
1 Was the problem resolved?		2 In the waiting		3 Was not resolved	
1	Yes. If yes, Did CC resolves the problem within stipulated time?	Waiting for how many days?		What is the reason?	
2	no	1	7-15 days	1	Lack of required skilled staff
1	Yes	2	15-30 days	2	Non-cooperation of designated officer
2	No	3	Above 30 days	3	Non-payment of additional money

2.5 How far you are satisfied with the methods/rules of services? (use √)			
1	Highly satisfactory	3	Not satisfactory
2	Moderately satisfactory		

3. Behavior/attitude of the City Corporation officer/staff involved in CC services

3.1 What were the behavior/attitudes of the officers/staffs with whom you contacted to get services?(use √)			
1	Decent	3	Indecent
2	Moderate		

3.2 How far you are satisfied with the dealings of officers/staffs? (use √)			
1	Highly satisfactory	3	Not satisfactory
2	Moderately satisfactory		

3.3 How was the officer/staff interested to provide services? (use √)	
1	Cooperative
2	Non-cooperative

3.4 How efficient was the above officers/staffs to provide services? (use √)	

1	Skilled	2	Moderately skilled	3	Not skilled
---	---------	---	--------------------	---	-------------

4. Complaints of the citizens regarding receipt and provision of CC services

4.1 Did you ever complain about receipt and provision of any CC services? (use √)

1	Yes	3	No
---	-----	---	----

4.2 Mode of complaint (use √)

1	In person	2	In writing	3	By telephone
---	-----------	---	------------	---	--------------

4.3 To whom you have made your complaint? (use √)

1	Mayor	2	Councilor	3	Concerned officer	4	Complaint cell
---	-------	---	-----------	---	-------------------	---	----------------

4.4 Was the complaint resolved in reasonable timeframe? (use √)

1	Yes	3	No
---	-----	---	----

5. Mode of grievance redress/preservation of CC

5.1 Are you aware of the mode of grievance redress/preservation of CC? (use √)

1	Yes	3	No (if no ask question 5.2)
---	-----	---	-----------------------------

5.2 What is your main suggestion for preservation and resolution of grievance? (use √)

1	Create opportunity for submission of grievance to responsible officer.	2	Keep scope to put grievance locally.	3	Circulate information on grievance redress/preservation mode.
---	--	---	--------------------------------------	---	---

6. Suggestions to improve quality of services

6.1 What are your suggestions to improve quality of services of CC?

1		4	
2		5	
3		6	